

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

Atique Gulbahar

Subject Specialist in Pakistan Studies, E&S Education Department, KP Pakistan.

Email: chatiquegulbahar@gmail.com

Saira Bano

Lecturer, Department of Pakistan Studies, Hazara University, Mansehra.

Email: sairabano@hu.edu.pk

Ayesha Alam

Head Department of Pakistan Studies, Hazara University, Mansehra.

Email: ayeshaalampk@gmail.com

Abstract

Religio-politics brought irreversible impacts on the dynamics of politics worldwide, since Athens and the emerging Europe human history has suffered a lot in employing religion as a tool of politics, empowering the authority of church over the state, narrating clergy as divine leadership and sacred institution over the general consents of masses and the well of an ordinary man made the state and politics dependent on religion and church. It is not only about Europe and the church, in fact, across the globe religion and politics are intermarried, and particularly the orthodox societies firmly believe that religion is a mainstream essence of politics. South Asia is one of the hot and triggering areas for researchers interested in investigating the interplay of religion and politics. Particularly, India and Pakistan are relatively more enriched to produce new aspects of the interplay of religion and politics and the outcomes. Pakistan, believed to be an ideological state, has employed religion to meet its different causes, at first to form a single uniform national identity, Islam is considered a tool to unite culturally heterogeneous societies. The state itself used a religion-oriented mechanism to address societal and constitutional issues. Later, the Bhutto regime made Pakistan a constitutionally religious state where the religion Islam was adopted as the state religion. The Bhutto regime is a key era toward making Pakistan a religious state, and politics of the state under the shadow of religion. The research aims to investigate and analyze the factors that led Bhutto to shift his socialist and secular

lining politics to purely religious polity.

Keywords: Religion, Politics, Islamization, Theocracy, Bhutto, Socialism.

INTRODUCTION

Religion is one of the defining elements in the politics of belonging and identity in modern South Asia (Veer 2002). The colonial system ended in the sub-continent posing the creation of two modern states of Pakistan and India. The political dynamics and values from the colonial period became the style of newly born states. Religion as a tool to meet political interests is one of the colonial-styled strategies. Either to divide in the name of religion or to curtail the sentiments against the state, religion remained an impactful tool for the state and the masters. Religious rhetoric during the Pakistan movement shaped the political mechanism of the newly born state of Pakistan, the state right after its birth adopted religion as a tool to address basic constitutional and national uniform identity issues. Initially, two factors led the state to engage religion in the political business of the state, at first the state think tanks thought, that religion was the only common thing between East Pakistan and West Pakistan so religion should be given prior status to unite the geographically alienated wings. Secondly, state intelligentsia miscalculated the existence of heterogeneous culture in Pakistan, to them it is a red indicator of the social unity of Pakistan, and again religion was considered the inclusive bond to unite the heterogeneous society. Mubarak Ali says that "they (the political elites and policymakers) decided to use religion to court the support of the people and provinces those were seeking their rights and their rightful place in the country. Islam was thus designated as the basis of Pakistan's identity" (Ali 2011:8). The intelligentsia considered religion as the only tool to suppress the rising voices of provincialism as religion was portrayed as the tool of unity.

Resultantly, the strong existence of religious forces on the political landscape of Pakistan posed a huge resistance to Bhutto's socialist and secular lining agenda. Bhutto's era was a period of transition from a socialist state to a more religious state. Right-wing political parties and clergy as pressure groups led Bhutto say goodbye to his socialist manifesto and to adopt a religious inclination in the political business of the state. There were external factors also involved in making Bhutto toward employing religion as political tool, like recognition of Bangladesh using religious reasons, friendly relations with Arab world and the Arab Leader, founding and hosting the OIC these were the factors led Bhutto to adopt religion as political tool. Internally, the unwavering pressure by religious forces made Bhutto take a shift in policies. Resultantly, Bhutto started to Islamize the state and his politics through using different socio-political means,

Clergy-State Alliance to Make Pakistan an Islamic State, Glimpses from History

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

*Pakistan became a Muslim state in South Asia, reflecting the two-nation theory. The state-sponsored historians and the then intelligentsia manipulated the two-nation theory in all the religious aspects, and the economic deprivation of Muslims of the united India was completely set aside. Keeping Islam aside, the subverted social and economic condition of Indian Muslims was also reason that led the Muslims toward Pakistan movement. 'Some continued to see in religious zeal the main driving force for the freedom movement; they de-emphasized or tried to ignore the economic situation of Indian Muslims a main factor that led the masses to support a separate state to rescue the economic rights' (Muneer Ahmed 1971). The leadership of the Muslim league justified the idea of a separate state by using religion as a *raison d'être*. Jinnah said, "The Hindus and Muslims belong to two different religious philosophies, norms, and literature. They neither intermarry, nor dine together, and they have different civilisations which are based mainly on conflicting ideas and conceptions" (Ahmed, 1970:380). The slogans and rhetoric being used to fuel the Pakistan movement brought irreversible effects even after the creation of Pakistan, the clergy with right-wing political parties came on the front line to Islamize the state.*

South Asia is an enriched political entity with cultural, linguistic, ethnic and religious diversities. South Asian state of Pakistan also has a heterogeneous culture and other diversities, but the state and intelligentsia took this as a threat to the unity of the state. Keith Callard says that the members of the Pakistani nation did not speak a common language; they did not have a homogeneous culture; they did not even have a geographical or economic unity (Callard 1957:1). Therefore, the state employed religion, and Islam was the only common thing in such diversities, for the cause of unity. Unity in the name of Islam brought long-lasting effects on the state's political nature. The political system of the newly born state made religion a new centre to be revolved around. To validate religious reasons in the two-nation theory stakeholders shaped the history of the freedom movement as a movement against the Hindus. Mubarak Ali in his book 'Pakistan in Search of Identity' argues that the freedom movement converted into the Pakistan movement, the official history of Pakistan was written to drop an imaging paradigm that, the Congress and Hindus were the only rivals of Muslims in the United India, consequently, creation of Pakistan was thought as a victory against Hindus rather than British crown (Mubarak 2011). In the counter to clergy, Ishtiaq Ahmed denotes that, the slogan of Pakistan as a separate state during the freedom movement had different descriptions, those who participated in the freedom movement described the idea of Pakistan according to their assumptions or what that suits their

interests¹⁶ (Ahmed 1987). ¹ Pakistan after its birth adopted some religious-based narratives like Islam and anti-Indianism, in its polity. Islamism is adopted as a cultural Idea while anti-Indianism is adopted to be a stronger uniting force (Varshney 2008).

Engaging religion in the socio-economic business of the state de-emphasized the sole cause of developing the state and the prosperity of ordinary citizens. Hamza Alvi argues that, the empty and bogus slogan 'Islam in danger' being projected by political elites because they were failed to facilitate the masses on other common issues (Alvi 2002). The state policies did not give privilege to the basic needs of common men because the state was engaged in nationalism rather than making strong policies against the ruined economy. Mubarak Ali argues that "they (the political elites and policymakers) decided to use religion to court the support of the people and provinces those were seeking their rights and rightful place in the country. Islam was thus designated as the basis of Pakistan's identity" (Ali 2011:8).

State-theocracy alliance started to use constitutional means to Islamize the state, a strong base to make Pakistan a religious state. Opposing Jinnah's 11 August speech² while addressing the first constituent assembly where he brought clear lines to make Pakistan a secular lining state, the writers of Objective Resolution (March 12, 1949) paved a constitutional way for a religious state. Jinnah's 11 August speech was a clear statement that "was intended to build a secular state (Munir 1979). Jinnah discounted the notion of Pakistan as a theocratic state and by his actions promoted and encouraged the idea of secular nationalism' (Ziring, 1984). The Objective Resolution and the clergy were steps ahead of the Islamic constitution, Shabbir Ahmed Usmani a main character in Objective Resolution says that,

"The Islamic state means a state which is run on the exalted principles of Islam...it can only be run by those who believe in those principles ... people who do not subscribe to those ideas (Islamic) may have a place in the administrative machinery of the state but they cannot be entrusted with the responsibility of framing the general policy of the state or dealing with matters vital its safety and integrity." ³

Jinnah asked Islamic rules to be followed but he never favoured Pakistan to be a theocratic state. The first contradiction became between Jinnah's speech of 11 August

¹ Pakistan meant different things to different people. To the landlords it meant continued leadership: to the doctrinal-minded Muslims, a unique opportunity to create an Islamic state in the light of their ideas: to the Muslim intelligentsia and the poorer classes, a state where social and economic justice would prevail and their dignity established, according to Iqbaliat teachings; to the peasants, freedom from the yoke of the Hindu money-lender; to the regional leaders, a greater autonomy than was expected in a united India dominated by Congress. Ahmed, Ishtiaq. (1987), *The Concept of an Islamic State: An Analysis of the Ideological Controversy in Pakistan*, London: Frances Pinter; New York: St. Martin's Press.

² Constituent Assembly of Pakistan Debates, Vol. I, No. 2, August 1947, pp 18-20.

³ The constituent Assembly debates, Vol. 5, 1949, p 45.

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

and the first provisions of the Objectives resolution. ⁴ Nawabzada Nasrullah Khan, a famous politician, argued that Jinnah did not speak in favour of a religious state run by religious clerics. Nasrullah says, 'M. A. Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan and the Muslim League leader, as well as other pioneer leaders of Pakistan, never intended Pakistan to be a theocratic state. The government's policy, as embodied in the objectives resolution which has formed part of the different constitutions, was that within a democratic framework, the state would endeavour to regulate the lives of the citizens of Pakistan' (Hassan, 1985).

The Constituent Assembly constituted the Basic Principles Committee (BPC) in 1949. It comprised 25 members about one-third of the total membership of the constituent assembly, Maulvi Tammiz-ud-din was assigned the chairmanship of BPC. The committee was assigned to formulate the basic principles for the future constitution of Pakistan. The Basic Principles Committee appointed the Board of Ta'illimat-i-Islamiya.⁵ The Board was assigned to propose Islamic provisions which could be inducted into the future constitution of Pakistan. Shah writes that the board advised the constitution that had medieval tradition pattern, that tried to fulfil the concept of the orthodox caliphate, for instance, the board advised that the head of state should be a Muslim (Shah 1996:46). The board came up with more complexities to offer clear idea of an Islamic state, to define the role of religion in political affairs. "The Ulama could not distinguish between the role of a priest and that of a head of the state" ⁶(Shah 1996:47).

On March 23, 1956, the Constituent Assembly passed the first constitution of Pakistan. The Objectives Resolution remained a key part of the constitution. "The Jamaat-e-Islami played a vital role in mobilizing theologians to favour an Islamic constitution. It maintained a hard-liner posture against India and helped the state by describing leftists, secularists, and ethnic nationalists as "anti-Islam unbelievers" (Haqqani 2005:27). The so-called Islamic constitution could not prevail for too long, a military dictator abolished it within the two years after its implementation. General Ayub Khan assumed the powers and decided to change the religious nature of the state.

⁴ Dawn newspaper. (June 20, 2010) article, entitled "Objective Resolution: the roots of religious orthodoxy".

⁵ The members of Board, who were the prominent religious scholars at that time. Maulana Syed Suleiman Nadvi, Syed Shabbir Ahmed Usmani, Mufti Mahammad Shafi, Professor Abdul Khaliq, Mufti Jafar Hussain, Dr. Muhammad Hamidullah and Maulana Zafar Ahmed Ansari appointed as secretary the Board.

⁶ In later these complexities delayed in making final constitution. When the Muslim league was questioned in delay of constitution, the PM Liaqat Ali Khan replied that, delay was inevitable 'because we want to frame our constitution on a new ideology, on Islamic principles...' Dawn, August 15, 1950.

'During the Ayub era 1958-1967, the military-bureaucratic elites shifted the focus from ideological-religious issue to economic issues' (Islam, 1981). 'To Ayub Khan, Islam is the source for progressive and cohesive nationhood...he introduced policies to bring liberal reforms in Islamic law to promote discursive space for Islamic modernism in opposition to that of the reified Islamic traditions' (Qasimi 2010). Ironically, he could not prolong his program. Ayub Khan's effort to remove any limitation in the name of Islam on legislative powers of the parliament also met a similar fate (failed to take place) (Qasmi 2010). General Ayub despite holding all powers could not sustain his secular lining politics, the clergy was more powerful to amend even the dictator.

Unity in the name of religion, despite the sole existence of clergy in both politics and making the state under its shadow, met with a disaster. The policymakers did not address the economic concerns of the Bengali masses, the state intelligentsia thought that only religious reasons were enough to deal with any issue, but it was a false calculation. "But they have not been very successful in using Islam to build a national consensus on more mundane issues like equitable allocation of economic resources between various parts of the country". (Saeed 1987:183) "This exploitation of Islam by the various regimes and the vested interests led to growing disenchantment with the ideology itself" (Mujahid, 1976:23). Eventually, despite of existence of Islamic ideology Pakistan could not remain united. It has been proved that all political matters possess their own dynamics, and religion cannot be the only single solution to everything. 'Unity in the name of Islam' had failed to counter-cultural dominance at all. ⁷

BHUTTO'S POLITICS: A SHIFT FROM SOCIALISM TO RELIGIOUS POLITY

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's regime is a key period in Pakistan to understand the religio-political dynamics in Pakistan. It was a regime of shifting the state's political nature from socialism to a purely religious state. Bhutto assumed the powers as the first CMLA (Civil Marital Law Administrator), at the time, there was triggering political unrest and chaos. He introduced a set of reforms to mend the existing socio-economic atmosphere, particularly socialism to curtail economic discrimination and secularism to renovate religious politics. His slogans and manifesto at the time of the general election of 1970 were all around on a secular socialist agenda. 'It is to Bhutto's abiding credit that he launched a political party with a socialist manifesto, thereby bringing to the fore urgent economic and social issues...successfully detaching religion from

⁷ Slogans of 'Islamic' ideology and 'Islamic' identity were taken up to counter Bengali anger. Instead of looking at the underlying causes of Bengali discontent, they put forward an argument that we are all 'Muslims and Pakistanis' and therefore we cannot be Bengalis or Sindhis or Baluch or Pathan. This was an ethnic redefinition which had little to do with religious values as such. It was merely a bankrupt political argument which led only to disaster. (Alvi 2002:1)

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

politics.⁸ Ironically, Bhutto's fascinating personality and political popularity could not resist pressure from the right-wing political parties. Within a short period, Bhutto appealed to the religious segments to make a shift toward religious polity. Eventually, in the second phase of government (1974 onwards), Bhutto in his speeches began to speak religious rhetoric and introduced religious policies, to counter the narrative that the PNA (Pakistan National Alliance) movement had portrayed against him, Bhutto immediately, announced a set of 'Sharita laws' to overcome the political pressure (Richter 1979).

Bhutto's Religious Rhetoric in General Elections of 1970 & 1977, A Comparison

Bhutto laid the foundation of his party named the 'Pakistan People's Party' on December 1, 1967, in Lahore. On the same day, Bhutto's party announced its manifesto, which aimed to 'attain classless society' through inducting 'Socialism' as a basic principle of PPP. Along with socialism, to avoid criticism by orthodox factions of society against socialism, the party announced that, the party will follow the social and political ethics of Islam⁹. He launched the election campaign with the slogans of 'Islam is our faith, Democracy is our policy, socialism is our economy, and all powers belong to the people.'¹⁰

In 1970, general elections were announced based on one man one vote. The political parties were banned by G. Ayub Khan, now the restrictions were removed, and all Political parties were asked to launch their election campaigns. Twenty-four political parties came to contest the elections. Comparative to PPP and Awami League, the Jamaat-i-Islami filed its candidates in both wings to contest the elections, meanwhile, PPP mainly focused on West Pakistan and Awami League only focused on East Pakistan except three candidates of Awami League who filed their nomination papers from West Pakistan. In the pre-election trend the religious political parties, especially, JI, JUP and JUI had a general perception that they would be victorious powers. Hussain Haqqani writes, "The intelligence services were facilitating the Islamist organizations, and the information ministry was projecting them as potential winners". (Haqqani 2005:46) Ironically, election results proved wrong the predictions and religious political parties did not win more than 17 per cent of the total share of the National assembly.

THE ELECTION CAMPAIGN OF 1970 AND ISLAMIC SOCIALISM

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto in his election campaign for the General elections of 1970,

⁸ Hyder, Khurshid. (2002), Pakistan under Bhutto, Current History, 63, 375. Quoted in, Richter, L. William. (1979), the Political Dynamics of Islamic Resurgence in Pakistan, Asian Survey, 19(6), 547-557.

⁹ Pakistan People's Party, the election manifesto of 1970. See also (Wolpert 1993: 149)

¹⁰ Manifesto of Pakistan People's Party, 1970 & 1977. www.bhutto.org

the entire manifesto of the PPP presented four points which were the basic agenda of the PPP. "Islam is our religion, Democracy is our policy, and Socialism is our economy and all power to the People".¹¹ Bhutto's idea of socialism in Pakistan received high remonstrations, especially from religious political schools. Therefore, Bhutto had to make sure that, Socialism is not an idea that is repugnant to Islamic principles. To resemble his socialism with Islam, Bhutto denoted the message of equality in Islam, He resembled his socialism with the concept of 'Equality' given by Islam. "The question is what socialism is? My dear friends, it is nothing but Islamic equality."¹² During the election campaign of 1970 Bhutto's attentions were determined to make Pakistan a socialist country, therefore he used Islam as a tool to validate his socialist economy. Bhutto's PPP was of the view that the conservative religious parties and the clergy represent capitalism which is in modern times a big means of exploitation. These parties are agents of 'backwardness' and social and 'spiritual stagnation'.¹³

In the General elections of 1970, PPP led by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto launched its election campaign and manifesto. On January 4, 1970, while addressing the public gathering at Nishtar Park Karachi Bhutto launched his election campaign for the general elections of 1970. Bhutto in his very first speech raised religious rhetoric, while addressing to masses, he said 'the very first and foremost principle of PPP is that Islam is our religion... dear friends we all are Muslims and we have struggled for Pakistan against the Hindus and British...' ¹⁴ in same speech Bhutto spoke about his address in the security council and his rendered services to Islam as a servant of Islam. At the beginning Bhutto started with two themes, first PPP's attachments with Islam and secondly his services rendered for the cause of Islam "Who dares to say that we are against Islam?" ¹⁵ In the same speech at Nashtar Park Bhutto continued to elaborate the bonds between socialism and Islam. Keeping in view the anti-Bhutto narrative by religious political parties, Bhutto had no option but to attach Islam to his socialist agenda. Therefore, in clarifying the contradictions between Islam and Socialism, he said "My dear brothers and sisters, if there was any conflict between Islam and Socialism, I

¹¹ Election Manifesto of Pakistan's People Party 1970, published in 1970, Karachi, Vision publication Limited. p. 12.

¹² Bhutto, Z.A. "Marching toward democracy" (speech, Public meeting at Gujrat March 1, 1970) Quoted in, Jalal, Hamad. & Hassan, Khalid. (edt), A Collective of articles, speeches and statements by Z.A Bhutto, Politics of the People, Vol three 1970-1971, Rawalpindi, Pakistan Publication. p 72.

¹³ Paracha, F. Nadeem. (Feb 21, 2013). Islamic Socialism a history from left to right, Dawn newspaper. Retrieved from, <https://www.dawn.com/news/787645>

¹⁴ Bhutto, Z.A. "launching election campaign" (speech, Nishtar park Karachi. January 4,1970), Accessed, 28.06.2018. https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_speech1.php.

¹⁵ Ibid.

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

*swear that we would have rejected socialism.”*¹⁶

After Sindh Bhutto entered Punjab with the same manifesto. The next spot was Rawalpindi, the famous ground of Liaqat Bagh where he delivered another speech on his election campaign. The main theme of his speeches remained the same, here he again spoke about his services rendered for the cause of Islam. But there is a little bit of difference in comparison to his previous speeches and the speech he delivered in Rawalpindi. Here he tried to show to the masses that, Bhutto is loyal to the cause of the unity of the Muslim Ummah. Therefore, he named the Middle East regarding the Arab-Israel war. ‘You know I have not only served in Pakistan but also served Islam in the Middle East. Allah will decide on the day of judgment how best I have served the cause of Islam.’¹⁷ All that he spoke it seems that he wanted to show his love of Islam and to end up his anti-Islam image among the masses. Once again, he used the same words ‘My dear friends, our foremost principle is: Islam is our religion, we are prepared to offer any sacrifice for the glory of Islam’.¹⁸ From Sindh to Khyber wherever Bhutto there were Islam and socialism. In Peshawar, Bhutto’s concerns remained the same, to validate his socialist manifesto among the masses and to eradicate the misconception regarding socialism and Islam he continued to speak on Islamic relativeness in Socialism. Who portrayed his socialism as anti-Islam? ‘There are many Muslim countries which are socialist. Have they ceased to be Muslim? Why is this question being raised in Pakistan? Quaid-i-Azam upheld Islamic socialism. He supported it before and after the establishment of Pakistan’.¹⁹

In Mardan, on February 25, 1970, Bhutto delivered his speech with the same religious rhetoric. Bhutto in his speeches always tried to attach socialism with Islam. ‘We shall serve the cause of Islam not only in Pakistan but wherever Muslims live. If I did not have the sense of honour of a Muslim and if I was not a true Muslim, I would not have been able to face India resolutely... Equality is the message of our religion (Islam), you can consult the Quran.’²⁰ Bhutto in another speech during the election campaign assured his belief in Islam and the Islamic principle of life. ‘We all are Muslims and God Almighty is witness to it. We recite Kalima of Islam. If some people do not regard the followers of socialism in the country as Muslim, they are damaging

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Bhutto, Z.A. “The change in foreign policy” (speech, Liaqat Bagh Rawalpindi, January 17,1970), Accessed 28.06.2018 https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_speech1.php.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Bhutto, Z.A. “Politics of the People” (speech, Jinnah park Peshawar, January 18,1970) Accessed 29.06.2018, https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_speech1.php.

²⁰ Bhutto, Z. A. “Basic issues are economic” (speech, Mardan, February 25,1970), Accessed 29.06.2018, https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_speech1.php.

the cause of Islam...'²¹ During another public meeting at Kohat, he publicly questioned the position of his political opponents who had been in a struggle to save capitalism under the cover of religion. Bhutto said, "The difference between us and our opponents pertains to the economic question... they (political opponents, who favoured capitalism) will not call for people's system. They are shielding themselves behind the slogan that Islam is in danger. This is a white lie."²²

ELECTION CAMPAIGN IN 1977, A SHIFT FROM SOCIALISM TOWARD ABSOLUTE RELIGIO-POLITICS

In 1977 Bhutto announced pre-date elections to elect a new Assembly. The campaign for new elections was a comparatively tough assignment for Bhutto than to the previous general elections of 1970, or it can be sum-up that, in these elections, Bhutto had to ensure that, he had delivered what he had promised in the previous election. Between 1970 and 1977 there were some internal and external factors, after the Egypt-Israel war in 1973 economic crises hit the world, therefore, "Bhutto regime tones down its socialist reforms and rhetoric and entered into several agreement and pacts with oil-rich gulf monarchies."²³ Holding the OIC conference in 1974, friendly relations with the leaders of the Muslim world, like Col. Qadafi from Libya and Shah Faisal of Saudi Arabia were close friends of Bhutto. Compared to the previous election of 1970, the religious political parties under the PNA movement came up with a new zeal for anti-Bhutto slogans. PNA's leadership had religious slogans that were being used to oppose Bhutto's policies. Due to strong political opposition released by PNA, Bhutto himself began to Islamize his politics. Bhutto's slogan of socialism is being replaced with 'Musawat-i-Muhammadi' (Equality of Muhammad) in other words it is meant that, 'Islamic egalitarianism' (Richter 1979).

As compared to the manifesto of the 1970 election of PPP by Bhutto that was socialist, in the 1977 elections, Bhutto brought immense change to grab the support of the masses. Hassan writes that Bhutto was committed to forming the Federal Ulama Academy to educate the Immams and Khatibs, making the shrines of the venerated saints centers of Islamic learning and strengthening the Islamic Research Institute at Islamabad. (Hassan 1985)

BHUTTO IN POWER AND PREFERENCE OF RELIGION IN DEALING WITH HOT ISSUES

On December 1971 Bhutto before the UN Security Council showed his

²¹ Bhutto, Z.A. "Socialism is Islamic equality" (speech at public meeting, Gujrat Punjab, March 1, 1970), Accessed, 29.06.2018. https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_spec1.php.

²² Bhutto, Z.A. "Constitution Not a final Goal" (speech at public meeting, Kohat NWFP, April 25, 1970), Accessed 29.06.2018, https://www.bhutto.org/1970-1971_spec1.php.

²³ Paracha, F. Nadeem. (Feb 21, 2013). Islamic Socialism a history from left to right, Dawn newspaper. Retrieved from, <https://www.dawn.com/news/787645>

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

aggressive attitude towards India to prevent Indian interference in East Pakistan. Bhutto after assuming powers did not stop the confrontations with India, it brought effects on the internal politics and policies of the country, as Haqqani noted, "Continued confrontation with India, based on an ideological imperative, justified higher defiance budgets. It also moved Bhutto away from his goal of secularizing the Pakistani state" (Haqqani 2005:68). Bhutto's government was in an illusion when it came to the recognition of the Bangladesh as sovereign country, the religious forces were not agreed in immediate recognition as it is taken matter of shame. Ironically, at the initial stages of the separation of Pakistan, Bhutto was also watching the impossible dream of the reunification of Pakistan. Bhutto used to call 'Muslim Bengal' or East Pakistan rather than Bangladesh because calling Bangladesh meant he accepted. Once in Bombay during Simla talks in 1972, he gave an interview to Mr R. K. Karanjia the Editor-in-charge of Blitz on October 31, 1972, he said that "if at any time Muslim Bengal or East Pakistan choose to have that kind of arrangement (federal constitution or federation) I would be the happiest man of the world..."²⁴ but it was not more than a phantasy of Bhutto. Pakistan had lost, now it became essential to recognize Bangladesh as a sovereign state if Pakistan wanted to develop mutually friendly relations with regional countries of South Asia as well as with another world, particularly the Muslim world. Bhutto adopted religion as a tool to attain the goal. Once in his speech at the floor of National Assembly, He raised Islamic rhetoric to counter Islamist who were not in favor to recognize Bangladesh. He said that "They (Bengalis) are the followers of our Prophet (peace be upon him), they do not want Hindu influence to reassert itself on their culture and on their life. Are we to help the process of reassertion of Hindu influence over Muslim Bengal? Muslim Bengal is Muslim Bengal... that is why I want to recognize Muslim Bengal, the Bengal of the Prophet (PBUH), the Bengal of Quran."²⁵

Soon after the freedom of Bangladesh, the Pakistani authorities had to surrender before the ground realities which were demanding the recognition of Bangladesh as a sovereign state. Bhutto said that "we must on no account give the impression that we are as obsessed with the past as to be divorced from realities."²⁶The government of Bhutto prevailed in the opportunity of the Islamic summit of OIC in 1974. Bhutto asked

²⁴ Z A Bhutto, Speeches and Statements, October 1 – December 31, publisher, Agha Amir Hussain, Classic, Lahore. The book is published under the supervision of Mr. Fakhar Zaman, Chairman National Commission on History and Culture.

²⁵ Z.A Bhutto, speech (on the floor of National Assembly) On July 10, 1972. President of Pakistan, Z. A Bhutto, Speeches and Statements, July 1, 1972 – September 30, 1972, Produced by, Directorate of Research, Reference & Publications, Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.

²⁶ Ibid.

that all Muslim countries should come to join Pakistan at this summit. He emphasized that Bangladesh, a South Asian Muslim country, would not be ready to sit with us in this session until or unless Pakistan, the hosting country, would have recognized Bangladesh as a sovereign state. Pakistan formally accepted Bangladesh as a sovereign state in 1974, moreover, in the same year, Shiekh Mujib visited Pakistan to participate in the 2nd OIC summit.

After 1974, Bhutto brought a change in his economic policies of socialism, the political upsurge made him walk with the demands of other political parties. Religious political parties were not in favor of socialism whether Islamic socialism or just socialism. "The PPP drifted from Islamic socialism in its second phase (1974-77) and accommodated the interest of religious political parties" (Chengappa 2002:31).

1973'S CONSTITUTION: ISLAMIZATION THROUGH CONSTITUTIONAL MEANS

Pakistan since its inception has gone through chaos and uncertainty in making a fruitful constitution. Bhutto's government passed the third constitution of Pakistan, which was implemented on August 14, 1973. The new constitution embarked on another wave of Islamization in the country. This constitutional Islamization led Pakistan to a conservative sort of religious state. Bhutto re-inducted some Islamic provisions from the previous constitution. Like, Under the constitution of 1973, once again it has been declared that "All existing laws shall be brought in conformity with the injunctions of Islam as laid down in the Holy Quran and Sunnah... no law shall be enacted which is repugnant to such injections."²⁷ To measure the Islamization of the Laws, Bhutto promised there shall be the Council of Islamic Ideology with the three months of the promulgation the constitution.²⁸ The Council of Islamic ideology is assigned to give suggestions on law-making in conformity with the Quran and Sunnah. According to the Constitution's article 230, "there shall be Council of Islamic Ideology on whose advice the law shall be reconsidered."²⁹

To investigate the conformity of any newly proposed law with the injunctions of Islam, The President or Governors of their respective provinces are authorized to send the draft to the council to confirm its Islamic jurisdiction. The council is only authorized to advise and suggest, it has no power to bound the house to mold the proposed law according to the recommendations of the Council. 'However, the religious political parties seated in the Assembly refused to sign the constitution unless the Islamic Council was given veto power over national parliament.' (Shah 1996:157). The Religious forces were becoming hard and hard on the state to influence their demands.

²⁷ Article 227, part IX of the 1973's Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

²⁸ Article 228, part IX of the 1973's Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan

²⁹ Provision to section (2) of the article 230 of the Constitution of Pakistan.

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

The religious atmosphere in the political landscape shaped Bhutto's politics completely religion-based politics. To appeal to religious forces Bhutto molded his politics toward religious slogans and laws. For the first time, under the 1973 Constitution, Islam was declared as the state religion. Like previous constitutions of 1956 and 1962, the state's official name remained 'Islamic Republic of Pakistan'. Declaration of Islam as a state religion had never been part of both previous constitutions, it was a constitutional effort to Islamize the state. The Constitution made it mandatory for the President, Prime Minister and other key post-holders to be a Muslim. Article 31 of the constitution declares that,

*"Steps shall be taken to enable the Muslims of Pakistan, individually and collectively, to order their lives in accordance with the fundamental principles and basic concepts of Islam and provide facilities whereby they may be enabled to understand the meaning of life according to the Holy Quran and Sunnah."*³⁰

The article 31 of the constitution, further ensured the Islamization of the constitution, like studying 'Islamic Studies' being made compulsory at the school level. Further in Article 38, to introduce the Islamic economic system, the State shall endeavour to eliminate riba (usury).

OIC CONFERENCE AND PAN-ISLAMISM; A WAY TOWARD RELIGIO-POLITICS

The Arab-Israel war of 1967 brought the Muslim world closer to the notion of Muslim unity. Pakistan was asked to come with the Arab world against the aggression of Israel in the land of Palestine. External threats from the non-Muslim world paved the way for the Muslim countries to formulate their platform where they could loud their voices and take a stand jointly. For this purpose, the Muslim countries formulated an organization named OIC (Organization of Islamic Cooperation) founded on September 25, 1969. Pakistan is one of the prominent countries that laid the foundation of OIC, from the day first since its inception, Pakistan has remained an active member. During the government of Bhutto, Pakistan hosted the 2nd OIC summit in 1974.

Bhutto established cordial diplomatic and religious relations with the Muslim world, particularly the Arab world. He entered the Arab world with the notion of unity of Muslims in the name of Islam. Bhutto made frequent visits to Arab countries; Bhutto was aimed to bring the Islamic countries on one platform where they could make forward Islamic block. The promoting PanIslamism at international level brought effects on internal political environment. For instance, unity of Muslim ummah the slogan raised by Bhutto, especially during ArabIsrael clashes, had pure religious

³⁰ Article 31, the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan (1973), Karachi, The Government of Pakistan, p 11.

sentiments. Therefore, it increased religious emotions among the masses and religious parties within Pakistan.

Under Bhutto's government Pakistan hosted Islamic countries in the Islamic summit that was held in February 1974, in Lahore. As compared to first the summit of OIC that was held in 1969 at Rabat, where only twentyfour countries joined, but the second summit remained very successful where, due to the personal interest of Mr. Bhutto, thirty-eight Muslim countries attended the summit. Bhutto successfully waxed his idea of unity in the name of Islam, resultantly Bhutto attained religious sympathies from both inside the country and outside the border as well. Bhutto addressed the Muslim leaders with extreme religious sentiments, internationally Bhutto's politics became under the shadow of religion. Shiekh Mujib from Bangladesh participated in the conference, Bhutto acknowledged his participation cordially and voiced the religious reasons for his participation rather than taking Bangladesh as a regional and neighbouring country. t. "I would have not been happy; my conscious would not have been clear if sixty-five million people who are Muslims and brothers in our arms of Bangladesh would not have participated."³¹

After mentioning Bangladesh in his speech Bhutto moved to show his strivings for the cause of Islam. This conference of Muslims, this conference of believers.... Let me conclude by telling my brothers and friends that, we as a poor nation with limited resources do not have the wealth to make contributions for economic institutions or funds ...but let me assure you with Allah as my witness that we shall give our blood for the cause of Islam." ³² Bhutto enthusiastically said his service would be rendered for Islam and the Muslim Ummah. The Arab world was facing security issues certainly due to Israel's aggression. Concerning security problems Bhutto said, "The people of Pakistan are the soldiers of Islam, and the armies of Pakistan are armies of Islam."³³ Hosting the Islamic summit in Pakistan, Z.A Bhutto heartily strived for Pan-Islamism, to attach Pakistani Muslims with the Muslims of other parts of the world. International attachment to Islamic countries became another factor for Bhutto to make Islam the basis of his politics. The notion of Islamic unity (Muslim ummah) had a great capacity to apply to the Pakistani nation. The Khilafat movement in 1919-24 was a striking example in the sub-continent.

ISLAMIZATION TO APPEASE PNA, END OF BHUTTO'S ERA

On January 7, 1977, the assemblies were dissolved, and Bhutto announced the date for fresh elections which were going to be held in March 1977. Bhutto believed that

³¹ Bhutto, Z.A. Concluding address to the Islamic summit conference (speech at 2ND OIC summit, Lahore, February 24, 1974) accessed, 06-07-2018, www.bhutto.org.

³² Ibid.

³³ Ibid.

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

he had enough support to win the elections once again, therefore, to get a fresh mandate he announced the earlier election. But misfortune for Bhutto, he could not estimate the pressure and power of opposition parties which formed PNA³⁴ (Pakistan National Alliance) to counter Bhutto. PNA was the hub of right-wing political parties, the mainstream leadership of PNA was laid in the hands of religious right-wing political parties. PNA's demands were not more than that Bhutto had already introduced or accepted in different ways, but the leadership of PNA cleverly brought it under the attractive shadow of religion. PNA's main slogan for the election campaign revolved around Nizam-e-Mustafa (A system given by Prophet Muhammad PBUH). It was purely religious clout to attract the common masses. PNA adopted some already running Islamic slogans in its manifesto, like banning alcohol, gambling, nightclubs, pornography, adultery, co-education, usury etc.³⁵

Bhutto's PPP again managed to win a heavy majority in the National Assembly. 17 million voters out of 31 million came to cast their votes. PPP won 60 per cent of the total cast votes and won 75 per cent representation in the assembly. PPP won 155 out of 200 seats in the parliament. On the other hand, the opposition under the alliance of PNA hardly could win 35 per cent of the total cast votes, a very low representation in the National Assembly that was a total of 17 per cent, in fact, not half of the total percentage of PPP (Wolpert, 1993:283). Consequently, to record protests the electoral process PNA refused to accept the election results. PNA alleged Bhutto of huge malpractice in the elections.

To overcome the pressure built by PNA leaders Bhutto just after assuming the power second time delivered his first speech in National assembly, '... we can set up a commission or can see what the Islamic ideology Council has already achieved on the question of those laws which eve can brought in conformity with the Holy Quran and Sunnah.'³⁶ Islam is enlightened and progressive force.' Further he says that the principles of Islam and which contained in holy Book are spelt out in the ideology of Pakistan are safest in the hands of those who believes in progressiveness, modernism and dynamism in Islam and who thinks that these principles can lead Islam toward a

³⁴ PNA was comprised on Nine-Political Parties named, 1. Jamaat-i-Islam, 2. Jamiat-e-Ulama-i-Islam, 3. Jamiat-i-Ulam-i-Pakistan, 4. Tehrik-i-Istaqlal, 5. Pakistan Muslim league, 6. Pakistan Democratic Party, 7. National Democratic Party, 8. Khaksar's Tehrik and 9. Azad Kashmir Muslim Conference.

³⁵ Dawn, February 10, 1977, Karachi, Quoted in, Shah, S. Mujawar Hussain. (1996), Religion and Politics in Pakistan (1972-88), Islamabad, Quaid-i-Azam Chair National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad

³⁶ Z.A Bhutto, speech, (after taking the oath of the office as the Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan), March 28, 1977, National Assembly Chamber, Islamabad.

modern force for human civilization.³⁷ It was called a total shift toward Islamization within the country.

On April 17, 1977, Bhutto's government announced a package of Islamization, in which he banned gambling, drinking, usury and night clubs etc. Bhutto's religious card by announcing a package of Islamic reforms, could not appease the religious parties who were demanding Nizam-e-Mustafa. Bhutto also took turns to take off the martial law that he imposed in the main cities like Karachi, Lahore and Hyderabad to tackle the situation. 'The Government, in Joint statement with the opposition, said martial law would end immediately in Lahore, Karachi and Hyderabad... the cities were put under Martial law nearly seven weeks ago as Prime Minister Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto moved to check opposition agitation and political violence that threatened to topple his government.'³⁸ The opposition forces successfully brought the government to assert their political powers, and resultantly, Bhutto moved to take them into negotiation to save his rule.

Bhutto and Maulana Maududi met in the mid of April 1977, to arrange some political settlements about the ongoing issue. Negotiation brought nothing but more popularity to PNA because the very next day of the meeting, Bhutto began to speak the language of religious clerics. Bhutto immediately announced some new religious policies, ironically all these provisions were proposed by PNA in its manifesto for Nizam e Mustafa. At first, He banned gambling, nightclubs, cinemas, and all other anti-Islamic activities or we can say all activities that were not suited to the clerics. Another big statement by Bhutto was, that the Quran and Sunnah would be the source of laws, and all existing laws that are repugnant to the Quran and Sunnah would be amended per the Quran and Sunnah within six months. Bhutto aimed to let down the PNA by fulfilling all points they had raised in their manifesto, if once their demands were fulfilled then they would have nothing to gather the masses around them. The confrontations between Bhutto and PNA made religion a more necessary element of politics. Bhutto promised another chain of efforts to show his party's commitment, establishing a Federal Ulama Academy to educate imams and khatibs of mosques, making the shrines of the venerated saints centers of Islamic learning, increasing hajj facilities and strengthening the Islamic Research Institute at Islamabad.' (Hassan, 1985) All efforts to appease religious clergy could not bring positive results for Bhutto. On May 12, 1977, he declared Friday as a weekly holiday. It was another little message to masses that, Bhutto is not anti-Islam. Bhutto on the other hand surrendered himself

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Marital law ended in 3 Pakistan cities, (June 8, 1977), The New York Times, <https://www.nytimes.com/1977/06/08/archives/martial-law-ended-in-3-pakistan-cities-government-acts-astalks.html>.

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

before the irrational demands of PNA, However, confession could not save him.

Anatol Lieven in his Book 'Pakistan A Hard Country' denotes that, In Pakistan 'the campaign for Shariah is not much about the Contents of the law as about popular access to the law, the speed of the law, and who gets to enforce the law.' (Lieven 2011) The Islamists under the flag of PNA were more concerned with powers rather than implementing Islamic laws. For instance, Bhutto nearly accepted all demands what have been demanded for the imposition of Islamic laws and reforms. As Lieven writes that the Islamist always since the inception of Pakistan had aim to acquire powers same PNA had been doing. Since the birth of Pakistan, However, theologians did not take side with democratic governments or dictatorial governments except General Zia-ul-Haq, to work on Islamization. In fact, Bhutto did a lot of work on Islamization to please clergy but could not enjoy the popular support by same clergy, the reason behind not to support Bhutto's government was that, probably, the religious clergy was determined to assume powers in the name of religion. Realistically the purpose of Islamization could be achieved by supporting and pressurizing to ruling government, for instance, Bhutto under immense pressure of religious forces took move toward Islamization and fulfilled the demands of religious parties.

CONCLUSION

The separation between religion and politics has been deeply discussed by various scholars, but still, the topic has infinite space to discuss in modern world politics. Religion since the time of Constantine has been employed by state or socio-political elites to attain political ends. The modern South Asian states progressed nothing to bring religious neutrality in their political systems. Pakistan a Muslim state of South Asia is considered as an ideological state, where religion is considered as state ideology. Pakistani state itself was inclined to bring religious zeal into every sphere of the state's business, including administrative policies, constitution-making, political policies and foreign policies. The elected rulers or martial law administrators never let their policies out of religious rhetoric.

As a result of the religious atmosphere in the political business of the state, even Z. A Bhutto could not overcome the religious influence in politics. Bhutto himself changed his policies and politics to appeal to religious forces. Bhutto used religious reasons to validate his economic-oriented manifesto, he tried to prove his socialism from Islam. Islamization first emerged as a nascent state policy under the Pakistan People's Party government led by the late Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. Religious forces, the clergy and right-wing political parties, posed a serious uncertainty and chaos to Bhutto government, resultantly Bhutto had to go for a tactical use of religion for political ends. Moreover, the friendly diplomatic relation Arab monarchs and the other Muslim world

became an external factor for Bhutto to Islamize his polity. Bhutto compromised on all that religious forces were demanding but could not secure his regime. Using religion as a political tool neither sheltered Bhutto nor Pakistan from theocracy and religious extremism.



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

References

- 1- Afrasaib. (2016). 1971: Facts and Fictions, view and perception in Pakistan, India and Bangladesh. Islamabad. Khursheed printers.
- 2- Ahmed Muneer. (1971). Failure of Nation-Building in Pakistan, Pakistan Forum, 2(3), 7- 14.
- 3- Ahmed, Ishtiaq. (1987). *The Concept of an Islamic State: An Analysis of the Ideological Controversy in Pakistan*, London: Frances Pinter; New York: St. Martin's Press.
- 4- Ahmed, Ishtiaq. (2008). Pakistan's National Identity, *International Review of Modern Sociology*, 34(1), 47-59.
- 5- Alavi, Hamza. (2002). *Social Forces and Ideology in the Making of Pakistan*. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 37(51), 5119-5124. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4412987>.
- 6- Ali, Mubarak. (2011). *Pakistan in Search of Identity*, New Delhi, Aakar Books.
- 7- Appiah, Kwame Anthony. (1991). Is the Post- in Postmodernism the Post- in Postcolonial? *the University of Chicago*, 17(2), 336-357.
- 8- Binder, Leonard. (1963). *Religion and Politics in Pakistan*, Berkley & Los Angeles, University of California press.
- 9- Callard, Keith. (1957). *Pakistan: A Political Study*, London, George Allen and Unwind Ltd.
- 10- Jaffar, Dr Saad, Dr Muhammad Waseem Mukhtar, Dr Shazia Sajid, Dr Nasir Ali Khan, Dr Faiza Butt, and Waqar Ahmed. "The Islamic And Western Concepts Of Human Rights: Strategic Implications, Differences And Implementations." *Migration Letters* 21 (2024): 1658-70.
- 11- Cohen, Stephen. (2004). *the Idea of Pakistan*, Washington, D.C. The Brookings Institution.
- 12- Evans, Walter Bennett. (2013). *The Genesis of the Pakistan Idea*, New York, Oxford University press.
- 13- Hasan, Mubashir. (2012). Geopolitics of political Islam in Bangladesh, *Harvard Asia Quarterly*, 60-69. <http://hdl.handle.net/10072/47246>.
- 14- Haqqani, Hussain. (2005). *Pakistan between Military and Mosque*, Washington D.C, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.
- 15- Hassan, Riaz. (1985). An Analysis of Religious, Political and Social Change in Pakistan, *Middle Eastern Studies*, 21(3), 263-284.
- 16- Jaffrelot, Christophe. (2015). *The Pakistan Paradox Instability and resilience*, USA, Oxford University press.
- 17- Jain, B.M. (2005). Ethno-religious Conflicts and Civilian Intervention in South Asia in the Context of India and Pakistan, *Indian Journal of Asian Affairs*, 18(1), 1-16.
- 18- Jalal, Ayesha. (1995). *Democracy and authoritarianism in South Asia; a comparative and historical perspective*, United Kingdom, Cambridge university press.
- 19- Lieven, Anatol. (2011). *Pakistan A Hard Country*, New York, Public affairs.
- 20- Malik, Yogendra., Kennedy, H Charles., Oberst, Robert., Kapur, Ashok., Lawati, Mahendra. & Rehman, Syed. (2009). *Government and Politics in South Asia*, USA,

INTERPLAY OF RELIGION AND POLITICS IN SOUTH ASIA PAKISTAN UNDER ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTTO, A SHIFT TOWARD RELIGIOUS STATE

Westview press.

- 21- Jaffar, Saad, Muhammad Ibrahim, Faizan Hassan Javed, and Sonam Shahbaz. "An Overview Of Talmud Babylonian And Yerushalmi And Their Styles Of Interpretation And Legal Opinion About Oral Tradition." *Webology* 19, no. 2 (2022).
- 22- Mandavaille, Peter. (2007). *Global Political Islam*, New York, Routledge.
- 23- Munir, Muhammad. (1979). *From JINNAH to Zia*, Lahore, Vanguard Books.
- 24- Mujahid, Sharif. (1976). *Ideology of Pakistan*, Lahore, Sang-i-meel.
- 25- Pickard, Cyril. (1997). *Change in Pakistan*, *The World Today*, 33(12) 446-453
- 26- Qasmi, Ali Usman. (2010). *God's Kingdom on the Earth*. *Modern Asian Studies*, 44(6), 1197-1253.
- 27- Qureshi, I.H. (2010). *The Struggle for Pakistan*, Karachi, University of Karachi.
- 28- Richter, L. William. (1979). *The Political Dynamics of Islamic Resurgence in Pakistan*, *Asian Survey*, 19(6), 547-557.
- 29- Sharif al-Mujahid. (1981). *Ideology of Pakistan*, Islamabad: Islamic Research Institute.
- 30- Abbasi, Abid Hussain, and Saad Jaffar. "Islamization of Zia Regime: an appraisal from gender perspective." *Al-Duhaa* 2, no. 02 (2021): 17-28.
- 31- Shaikh, Farzana. (2008). *Cultural Transnationalism in Pakistan*, *Third world Quarterly*, *Development and Cultural Nationalisms*, 29(3), 593-609.
- 32- Shah, S. Mujawar Hussain. (2014). *Bhutto Zia and Islam*, larkana, Shaheed Bhutto Publication. www.bhutto.org.
- 33- Shah, S. Mujawar Hussain. (1996). *Religion and Politics in Pakistan (1972-88)*, Islamabad, *Quaid-i-Azam Chair National Institute of Pakistan Studies*, *Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad*.
- 34- Shaikh, Farzan. (2009). *Making sense of Pakistan*, New York, Columbia University Press.
- 35- Adil, Muhammad, and Dr Sardar Muhammad Saad Jaffar. "Role Of Religious Parties In Legislation In Parliament Of Pakistan (2013-18): A Critical Analysis." *Webology* 18, no. 5 (2021): 1890-1900.
- 36- Smith, W. C (1954) *Islam in Modern History*, New York, Mentor Book.
- 37- Varshney, Ashutosh. (2008). *The Idea of Pakistan*, *India International Centre Quarterly*, 35(3/4), 2-21
- 38- Veer, Peter van der. (2002). *Religion in South Asia*, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, vol 31, 173-187.
- 39- Wolpert, Stanley. (1993). *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan*, Oxford University press, New York.
- 40- Ziring, Lawrence. (1984). *From Islamic Republic to Islamic State in Pakistan*, *Asian Survey*, 24(9), 931-946. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2644077>.