International Research Journal of Social sciences and Humanities, Vol.:03, Issue: 01,Jan-June,2024
PP:715-731

OPEN ACCESS
IRJSSH
ISSN (Online): 2959-1392
ISSN (Print): 2959-2887
www. irjssh.com

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION: A PEDAGOGY OF PEACE, COEXISTENCE, ACCEPTANCE AND PROSPERITY IN SINDH, PAKISTAN

Noor Hussain Shar
Director IBA Community Colleges, Sukkur IBA University.
Email: *noorhussain.cc@iba-suk.edu.pk*

Abstract

Keeping in view the present socioeconomic conditions of Sindh, Pakistan and the existing quality of teaching in Government schools, this article justifies the use of global citizenship education as a transformative pedagogy. The paper justifies the use of critical global citizenship education to prepare the learners' identities at the intersection of local, national and global. Moreover, this paper suggests the use of Blackmore's(2016) pedagogical framework for Global citizenship education which implies that the learners use critical thinking, dialogue and reflection. This framework includes the dimensions of critical thinking, dialogue, reflection, and responsible being/action. The components of the suggested frameworks have practical relevance in the context of developing learners' identities. Wherein, critical thinking is about knowing our assumptions and assessing their accuracy, dialogue is a prerequisite for critical thinking because it allows learners to engage with others having different opinions and reflection is considered a regular exercise for all ordinary people. Transformative pedagogies create conditions for developing identities of teachers and students in relation to one another, where knowledge is constructed in the participation of educators and learners, and the process of identity formation is like "being-in-becoming" (Farren, 2016, p193). The paper suggests that developing learners' identities assigns teachers a critical role, where teachers facilitate interpretation of the concepts of GCE and its practices; hence, it becomes crucial to explore how teachers conceptualise GCE, what pedagogies they use and provide the learners with the opportunities to use critical thinking, dialogue, and reflection.

Keywords **:** *Transformative Pedagogy, Global Citizenship Education, Sindh, Social Studies, Pakistan Studies.*

INTRODUCTION

In the wake of increasing globalisation, Global Citizenship Education (GCE) has a vital role in developing responsible global citizens, subsequently, several countries like Australia, Canada, the UK, the members of the EU, and South Korea

have incorporated GCE concepts in their curricula (Global Schools 2016). A need to develop students as responsible global citizens is also highlighted in national education policies in Pakistan (MOE 2009; MFE&PT 2017) and the same is reflected in the curriculum and textbooks in Sindh.

With a population of 47.85 million, Sindh is Pakistan's second-largest and most urbanised province (Govt. of Pakistan 2022). It is the Southeastern province of Pakistan, spread over 140,914 square kilometres, having Punjab in the North, Balochistan in the West, the Arabian Sea in the South-West and India in the East and South-East. Being one of the oldest civilisations in the world, known as the Indus Valley civilisation, the ancient history of Sindh is known from 3,000 BCE (Husain, Quraishī, and Hussain 2019). The remains of the old architecture and script found from archaeological sites like Moen-jo-daro confirm that in ancient history, "in Sindh there existed a teaching-learning system which enabled the people to read, write and perform other technical skills like making jewellery, minting, woodwork and civil engineering" (Shar, 2022, p.2). For centuries, Sindh has been rich in agriculture, leather industry, textile, and handicrafts (Sheedai 2021). In the eighteenth century, Shikarpur, a city in northern Sindh, "was at the heart of trading exchanges from Sindh all the way to Central Asia" (Faiz, 2021, p.12). After the British took over, Sindh was integrated into the Bombay presidency in 1847, however, it was during the British colonial period that the Sindhi language was promoted as an official language and the schools that taught the Sindhi language received the grant from the government (Ibid).

Before British rule, which ended in 1947 and Sindh became part of a newly born country Pakistan, it was ruled by various empires and dynasties, many of them came from other parts of the world. These different rulers came along with their cultures and languages making Sindh a very diverse society in terms of ethnicities, cultures, and languages. Several immigrant races have integrated with local races to such an extent that today they can hardly be identified (Allana 2012).

The religious diversity of northern Sindh with Sukkur as its centre is evident from religious places of Muslims, Hindus, Christians, Sikhs, and Sofis, i.e. mosques, temples, churches, Dharamshala and dargahs existing in Sukkur city and throughout the whole district. From the present ethnic perspective, northern Sindh is populated by various ethnic groups, i.e. Sindhis, Punjabis, Baloch, Sraiki and in urban areas there are also Muhajir (Urdu-speaking communities) and others. In Sukkur district, the linguistic distribution of the population informs that 78.75% of the population speak Sindhi, 12.5% Urdu, 3.35% Punjabi, 2.25% Pushto, 0.85 Balochi, 0.8% Siraki, and 1.5% other languages which include Memoni, Marwari, Gujrati, Bihari, Brahui and Kachi (Bullo 2017). Hinduism is the second largest religion in northern Sindh,

having various religious places in district Ghotki and a historical temple on Sadhbelo island in the river Indus adjacent to Sukkur with pilgrims and tourists visiting from all across the country. According to the minorities affairs department of the government of Pakistan, 93% of the Hindu population of Pakistan lives in Sindh which makes up 7.5% of the total population of the province (Minorities Affairs Department 2018). The diverse culture in Sindh is also connected with the last several decades of migration under British rule in Sindh that started with the annexation of Sindh with the Bombay presidency, accelerated during the partition of India in 1947 and the creation of a new state of Pakistan. During British rule, the population of Sindh substantially increased with the Punjabi settlers (Faiz, 2021) and then another big migration of Muslims from India at the time of partition came to Sindh. The recent influx of Pashtuns came to Sindh during the Afghan war. Another migration that has continued over the decades is from Balochistan. This influx of people of different ethnicities has made Sindh a territory where some of the people belonging to various cultures have assimilated and some others have tried to maintain their original identities. Though "the massive exchange of population between India and Pakistan fundamentally reconfigured Sindh" (Faiz, 2021, p.39), and the ethnoreligious composition of the province was changed, it did not change the diverse nature of Sindh's population. At the time of partition in 1947, a great exodus of Sindhi-speaking Hindus from Sindh and migration of Urdu-speaking from India reshaped the social fabric of Sindh. Still, in Sindh, a sizable population of Hindus reflects a diverse society which has become more diverse with the influx of Punjabi and Baloch population due to the proximity of Punjab and Balochistan provinces to the northern Sindh. Sukkur, the main city of northern Sindh, located on the bank of the river Indus, is greatly a diverse city in terms of ethnicities, religions, languages and cultures. Being located almost at the centre of Pakistan and in easy access to to three provinces of the country, Sindh, Punjab and Balochistan, Sukkur possesses a cultural richness and diversity which is only second to Karachi in the country.

Several education systems are simultaneously functioning in Sindh, including government schools, government schools adopted by Education Management Organisations (EMOs) and NGOs, low-fee private schools, elite private schools, religious schools (Deni Madaris), NGOs and trust schools, Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) sponsored private schools and armed forces managed schools and cadet colleges. According to the latest statistics from the school education and literacy department, there are 36,646 functional schools in Sindh (SE&LD, 2019).

Amongst the above-mentioned available choices of schools, the selection of schools for children depends upon the family's income, and locality. Elite private schools are only available in big cities and only affluent families can send their children either to elite private schools or cadet schools run by the armed forces. These

schools charge high fees which common people hardly afford, English is the medium of instruction, and many of these schools also offer international certifications like the International General Certificate for Secondary Education (IGCSE) and Cambridge International Examination (CIE) programmes. These certifications open opportunities for the placement of graduates in good-quality higher education institutes in Pakistan and abroad. While in all other types of schools, i.e. government schools, government schools adopted by EMOs or NGOs, low-free private schools, NGOs' and trust schools, the students graduate within the national education system which is assessed and certified by the Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISEs); their qualification does not enable them to compete with their contemporary students from elite schools having IGCSE and CIE qualifications. Thus the existing school education system perpetuates the existing divide in Pakistani society between the affluent class and those who live a hand-to-mouth existence. It is also noteworthy that teachers who teach international curricula see GCE as an opportunity for the progress and development of a good image of the country (Ashraf, Tsegay, and Ning 2021).

For the majority of the common people in cities, rural areas, and small towns there are low-fee private schools, SEF-supported private schools, government schools, trust schools and the government schools adopted by EMOs and NGOs, where with slight differences the quality of education is the same.

Religious schools or Deni Madaris are a different phenomenon. In Sindh, according to the latest available official data, there are 758 registered (MOFE&T 2021) and several unregistered Deeni Madaris, the majority of the registered Madaris belong to the Ahle-e-Hadis sect. In 2019 a Directorate General of Religious Education (DGRE) was established with its headquarters in Islamabad and regional offices in provinces. The DGRE has a mandate to mainstream religious education in Pakistan, register Deeni Madaris, collect data and facilitate foreign students in obtaining visas for admission to Deeni Madaris. In Sindh, DGRE has three regional offices in Karachi, Hyderabad and Sukkur. Deeni Madaris are sect-oriented representing different schools of thought in Islam i.e. Barelvi, Deubandi, Shia, Ahl-e-Hadis and Jamaat-e-Islami (Sodhar, Rasool, and Nisa 2013). There are two types of students attending religious schools, a) a great majority of students who attend formal schools also attend Madaris, on a part-time basis, in the early morning or evenings to study the Holy Quran, and b) there are students who attend full-time residential Madaris. Since residential Madaris provide free education, their students come from poor sections of society. Religious-mindedness of the families is another reason for sending children to the Madaris. Though there are several schooling systems and Deeni Madaris as discussed above, the government schools still accommodate the greatest chunk of the student population in Sindh. The differences in pedagogical approaches,

the infrastructure of schools, and the qualifications of teachers across diverse educational institutions prompted the focus of my exploration on government schools, given their role as primary providers of education.

The School Education & Literacy Department of the government of Sindh is responsible for the management of schools, in addition to the core department of education, other ancillary institutions provide support to the school education system and they have their separate mechanism. These support institutions include the examination boards known as Boards of Intermediate and Secondary Education (BISEs), Teacher Education Institutes (TTIs), and the Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment and Research (DCAR). The BISEs arrange public examinations of students of classes IX, X, XI & XII, assess their papers and announce results. The TTIs are responsible for teacher education programmes and the continuous professional development of teachers, and the DCAR develops, revises and updates the curriculum (SE&LD 2019).

Despite having a proper organisational set-up of the school education department and several local, national and foreign aid interventions in the education sector in Sindh the adult literacy rate fluctuates between 58 to 61 % with some contradictions in various reports (Bureau of Statistics 2021). Moreover, reports of the Bureau of Statistics also indicate a gender gap in adult literacy,i.e. women's literacy in Sindh is 53% and men's literacy at 70% (Fiance Division Government of Pakistan 2023). This gender discrimination continues even after education a great number of women do not join the workforce. According to a report from the Asian Development Bank female labour force participation was only 25% in Pakistan in 2016 (ADB 2016). Also, there is a difference in wages as well in the country. "Pakistan stands second to last in the Global Gender Wage Gap; women's labour force participation is a mere 22 per cent, the lowest in South Asia" (Khan 2020, 30).

Although the education department and its ancillary bodies have an intact organisational structure from a school to provincial headquarters, prima facie they are responsible for providing all the necessary services for education in schools, the schools' regular functions such as the availability of proper school infrastructure, textbooks for the students, and teachers according to the number of students have never been fulfilled. For instance, in 2019 after one year of the completion of the tenure of the Sindh Education Sector Plan (SESP) 2014-2018, none of the access-to-education-related targets was met and several actions were not even initiated to meet the requirements of access-related policy pillars. 50% of schools lack the most basic facilities, i.e. boundary walls, electricity, washrooms, and drinking water (UNESCO-IIEP 2019). Due to the shortage of secondary schools, access to secondary education is an issue as the portion of secondary schools in Sindh is only 12 % while 74% of schools are primary schools which results in huge dropout of students after the

completion of primary education. In Sindh, 50% of the dropout is reported after class fifth (Ibid).

GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN GOVERNMENT SECONDARY SCHOOLS

After the 18th constitutional amendment in 2010, education became a provincial subject; like other provinces, Sindh also got autonomy in legislation and other education-related matters (Jamal 2021). Accordingly, the Sindh government has revised curricula and textbooks, while other provinces follow the single national curriculum. The government of Sindh has made GCE part of secondary education in Sindh by incorporating several GCE-related benchmarks, themes and students' learning outcomes (SLOs) in the SS and PS curricula and textbooks. This addition of GCE concepts in education serves the purpose of national education policies (NEPs) which envision developing students as responsible global citizens and contribute to promoting active citizenship.

The government secondary schools, mostly called high schools, which are the specific context of this paper, usually teach students from class VI to X. According to the school education literacy department, there are 2026 functional secondary schools in Sindh (SE&LD 2019). In these schools, from class VI to VIII, the students learn three language subjects -Sindhi, Urdu, and English, and four other subjects Social Studies, Islamiyat, Mathematics, and General Science. Classes IX and X have different subjects, including three language subjects -Sindhi, Urdu, and English, four science subjects- Physics, Chemistry, Mathematics and Biology/Computer, and two additional subjects, i.e. Islamiyat and Pakistan Studies.

GCE-related concepts are embedded in SS and PS textbooks in the chapters related to history, geography, citizenship (national and global), constitution and government, human rights, national and world population, knowledge about cultures and peoples of South Asia, world resources and global governance structures like the United Nations Organisation (UNO) and its agencies and structure, local and global problems like climate change and global warming, concepts of justice, peace, tolerance and conflict resolution. The findings of another research with student teachers revealed that although the respondents, who were alumni of government schools, appreciated the idea of global citizenship, however, when it came to their identities and practices, many of them showed hesitancy about their global identities resulting in limited active participation in global citizenship activities. These findings provided an impetus for exploring the teaching of GCE in Sindh.

GCE has several definitions and it has many advocates (Schattle, 2008; Brown, 2016; UNESCO, 2015) also some scholars like Jooste and Heleta reject the very idea of global citizenship and argue that it "is not a viable and desirable

proposition for the South" (Jooste and Heleta, 2017, p.39). Along with these contradictions, the idea of GCE is connected with processes of globalisation (Baildon and Alviar-Martin, 2021; Schattle, 2008a; Imber, 2002). However, I believe that GCE is a more expansive concept than globalisation which is a modern phenomenon. Global identities are an older phenomenon; in 450 BC Socrates claimed that his country of origin was 'the world' around a hundred years later Diogenes the Cynic claimed to be a citizen of the globe (Leduc 2013). Considering the global interconnectedness which creates a sense of global fraternity and implicates us in a complex relationship and the "chains of production and consumption, trade and economy" (Blackmore, 2016, p.49) that makes us responsible to other fellows it is necessary for educationists and policymakers to realise that by limiting the learners to national citizenship does not enable to the youth to understand and respond to ever-increasing global interdependence, yet they also need to practise and appreciate their global identities. A global framework to theorise citizenship is also essential due to the increased space of individual influence and agency, which one can exercise in a transnational or global space in exchanging ideas and doing market activities regardless of state control.

Given that Pakistan is a diverse country, wherein Sindh is the most diverse province with different languages, cultures, religions/sects, and ethnicities, and the country is facing problems like poverty, global warming, climate change, and terrorism. In one way or another, the people of Sindh face many of these problems. Heavy rain in 2022 is an example of the devastating effect of climate change on the lives of people in Sindh. According to a UN report, in Pakistan, 33 million people were affected by rains in 2022 (Balding, n.d.). Poverty is a global issue, and it has been a severe problem in Sindh for a long time. From a broader perspective, all such local and regional issues are global; therefore, they must be addressed globally. Hence, there is a need to develop young learners as responsible global citizens to play active roles. Addressing these issues requires transformative citizens who feel outraged by social injustice (Jefferess 2012) and are ready to use their agency to improve society. GCE prepares transformative citizens who are willing "to take action to promote social justice even when their actions violate, challenge, or dismantle existing laws, conventions, or structures" (Banks 2008, 136). Hence GCE has a central role in developing the learners as active citizens who play their part in addressing the issues the people are facing.

Jooste and Heleta, (2017) believe that the dominant ideas of GCE are the part of discourse generated by powerful countries and the dominant institutions shape and unfold the relevant concepts of global politics and economics and the realities of weaker nations are ignored. Therefore, it is vital to carefully analyse what approach and perspective is required to be adopted in Sindh. Considering the existing socioeconomic and political conditions of Sindh a critical approach that engages

learners in critical thinking and reflection and empowers them to exercise their agency is advisable for this context. In this regard, Kadiwal and Durrani's (2018) findings indicate students' eagerness to play their role in the transformation of social, political and economic conditions which the existing education system and pedagogy cannot do. Although the students in Sindh cannot define GC, they exercise critical GC, though the students had limited capacity, they showed an outrage and a desire to take action to transform society (ibid), which characterises the practices of critical GC.

In this globalised world where people often collaborate, enter into business deals, exchange ideas, influence others and get influenced regardless of borders and their national identities, I realise that our past, present and future are closely connected with the whole globe, whole humanity, and other living and non-living things on the globe. This connectedness creates a sense of global fraternity and implicates us in a complex relationship and "chains of production and consumption, trade and economy" (Blackmore, 2016, p.49), which makes us responsible to other fellows and expect responsible actions from others. Hence, I believe human actions on the planet need to be 'responsible' because the planet is not anyone's property, and that we all share it (Shar, Chang, and Siyal 2023). Moreover, it is not only about sharing the responsibility for the present or future; there is also a need to reflect on the past, understand the historical processes that have been instrumental in creating and reinforcing inequalities and injustices specifically in Sindh and generally in the world and understand our future roles as responsible global citizens. GCE, which involves critical thinking, reflection and dialogue, develops among learners a sense of agency and responsibility in a highly globalised world (Blackmore 2016). With global identities, individuals realise an urgency to respond to local and global issues, play active roles, and exercise their agency for a better tomorrow.

Gradually, the concept of GCE is gaining importance and getting the attention of scholars worldwide and is being studied from various aspects (Ashraf, Tsegay and Ning, 2021; Guo, 2014; Schattle, 2008). Along with increasing attention to GCE, there is a realisation that global issues cannot be addressed at the national level, and the scholars of citizenship also realise that "there are now more ways of being a citizen than have perhaps previously been recognised" (Osler and Starkey, 2005, p.8). One of them can be extending the idea of citizenship outside the geographical and political boundaries and making it global. Additionally, there is a consensus that education for national citizenship does not prepare students for global interdependence, and it is becoming essential that learners are prepared to participate in an increasingly globalised world (ibid). Hence the need to educate the youth about their roles and responsibilities as global citizens is inevitable.

Combined with the increasing relevance of globalisation in the lives of

individuals and societies, the deplorable socioeconomic conditions of the people of Sindh, who are the victims of local and global issues like poverty, global warming, climate change, and violations of fundamental rights (Gul et al. 2022; Memon et al. 2019; Sherman et al. 2017) there is a dire need to develop "self-reliant individuals capable of analytical and original thinking, a responsible member of society and a global citizen" (MOE 2009, 18). Several communities, in Sindh, live in subhuman conditions where they do not have access to basic facilities of life. The issues people face require them to understand that their local manifestation has global roots, hence local solutions can only work if the global causes are addressed. The effectiveness of their agency is possible with global connectedness and consciousness of global-local dynamics. Such citizens can question the status quo and use their agency to improve society in collaboration with the global community with the expectation of a broader impact. The education policies suggest developing youth as responsible global citizens, and the ground realities of Sindh need such transformation. NEP 2009 also aims to develop the learners as self-reliant, possessing thinking and analytical skills and responsible members of society and global citizens (MOE 2009). Thus the NEPs see education as instrumental to developing individuals who possess thinking and reflecting capabilities to play an active role in society, be responsible citizens, and make the right choices for themselves and others. To serve this purpose, the curriculum and textbooks of SS and PS contain several GCE-related topics, however, there is no empirical evidence of how the concepts of global citizenship are taught to the students in Sindh.

In Sindh, where citizenship agency is low (Pasha, 2015) teaching GCE concepts may be challenging, therefore, the conceptualisation of GCE needs careful thinking on what type of GCE and what pedagogical approaches will enable the students "to make sense of their role and place in the global world" (ibid, P.34). Well-thought conceptualisation and pedagogical approach will give a proper direction to GCE and make it beneficial for the learners, and the society in this context. This will also require teacher preparation programmes for GCE in Sindh so that the curriculum and textbooks can properly be useful for the students. At present, in Sindh, there are hardly GCE –related professional development programmes other than the British Council's Connecting Classrooms (www.britishcouncil.pk/connecting-classrooms-Pakistan), which is run by a small number of schools voluntarily. The webpage Connecting Classrooms in Pakistan claims that "the focus of the programme is to enhance the teaching of global citizenship in schools by enriching the curriculum and inspiring improvements in teaching and school leadership, in turn, to improve educational outcomes for young people" (ibid). Given that the curriculum and textbooks of SS and PS contain a small amount of content, there is much space in these subjects for curriculum enrichment and improving students' learning outcomes

to make them well-informed and responsible global citizens who can exercise their agency for creating a better future and challenge the status quo.

Along with several issues people face in the country, rights are "becoming a luxury guaranteed only to the rich or the upper middle classes, while the rest of the citizens struggle for basic amenities" (Lall and Saeed 2020, 30). The NEP 2009 recognises this and notes that:

"The educational system in Pakistan is accused of strengthening the existing inequitable social structure as very few people from the public sector educational institutions could move up the ladder of social mobility. If immediate attention is not paid to reducing social exclusion and moving towards inclusive development in Pakistan, the country can face unprecedented social upheavals" (MOE 2009, 12).

Such social upheavals have been observed in Pakistan throughout history in the shape of ethnic and religious conflicts and violence. The students must understand the nature and severity of these issues and the consistent extreme inequalities in society and realise the urgency to address them. Regardless of the teachers' critical role in teaching, GCE can be instrumental in enabling the students to think critically and reflect on whether change is possible with existing ways of education or whether the existing education is instrumental in perpetuating inequalities.

GCE needs to be taught throug transformative pedagogy (Banks 2008; Blackmore 2016), and Banks suggests that transformative academic knowledge enables students "to challenge inequality within their communities, their nations, and the world; to develop cosmopolitan values and perspectives; and to take actions to create just and democratic multicultural communities and societies" (Banks 2008, 135). Considering Sindh's present socioeconomic and political conditions, it is necessary to adopt a transformative pedagogy so that the students can think critically and understand their roles and responsibilities in shaping their futures and identities. Education must enable the learners to reflect and engage in dialogue and frame their identities (Blackmore 2016) in relation to others, recognising their roles and responsibilities.

Many researchers and scholars of GCE conceptualise GCE as a response to globalisation (Pais and Costa 2020). However, in the context of Sindh, where the children in government schools have minimal access to the outside world, the idea of GCE can also be seen from a different perspective which should engage the learners in the process of identity formation where learners may take responsibility to use their agency to question the status quo. The students must be sensitised to create an urgency to resolve the most daunting issues, such as extreme economic inequalities, violations of fundamental human rights, and access to education and essential health facilities. Playing an active role in resolving such issues requires transformative and

critical GCE.

Scholars theorise global citizenship as an approach to citizenship that recognises "that urgent and troubling issues are global in scope: for example, poverty, global warming, AIDS, racism, and wars" (Pashby, 2012, p.10), therefore these issues can be addressed through using a global approach which does not oversimplify the issues and suggests symptomatic solutions, but it needs a serious approach that looks at the issues with a critical perspective. Blackmore's pedagogical framework for critical GCE, which I suggest as a pedagogy for teaching Social sciences in schools in Sindh plays a central role in developing the learners' identities. This pedagogy enables learners to apply logic, to explore whether our assumptions are accurate (Blackmore 2016), and it breaks the myth that knowledge is there in the textbooks and is the same for all. When the learners are engaged in critical thinking, they realise that knowledge is fluid, provisional, and open to negotiation (Andreotti 2010). Another dimension of critical GCE is dialogue; when learners engage with others in dialogue, they encounter alternative perspectives of seeing the world (Blackmore 2016); thus, they know the alternatives. The third dimension in this framework is the reflection; Blackmore notes that "perhaps the signature move of a critical global citizenship education is the emphasis on reflection and a focus on examining the self and one's own assumptions, knowledge, and implication" (Blackmore 2016, 44). To become responsible global citizens, the learners in Sindh need to reflect on their roles and assumptions and be able to exercise their agency for the transformation of the current state of affairs in the country. Reflection helps learners create connections between thinking, feeling and acting as responsible citizens (Blackmore 2016). They must think about the problems they and their families and fellows face, feel the sensitivity and severity of the issues, understand the implications of such issues for the well-being of the people and develop a sense of urgency to resolve them. Such understanding and feeling coupled with the realisation of the power structures that perpetuate inequalities will be essential to prompt the use of one's agency to change the status quo. The fourth dimension of this framework is 'responsible being/action, which is closely connected to the previously discussed pedagogical dimensions. Responsible being/action is an outcome of critical thinking, dialogue and reflection or in Blackmore's words, as a result, "there may be transformation and change" (ibid, p.44). The existing state of affairs in the province needs social transformation which is also envisioned in the national education policies. For instance, NEP 2009 notes that education must bring "equitable economic growth and social advancement" (p.17). NEP 2017-25 notes that "school will act as agent of change for the local community" (MFE&PT 2017, 139). Although the policies do not engage at a deeper level with the idea of individual or social transformation, they create a space for reflection and engagement which can be utilised to develop and enrich the curriculum and

pedagogies. The components of the suggested frameworks have practical relevance in the context of developing learners' identities in Sindh. Critical thinking is about knowing our assumptions and assessing their accuracy. These assumptions may be "paradigmatic- how we view the world; prescriptive-how we think the world should work and how people should behave; and causal- why things happen the way they do" (Blackmore, 2016, p.42). Dialogue is a prerequisite for critical thinking because it allows learners to engage with others having different opinions, and "the most obvious way to engage with the difference is through dialogue" (Blackmore 2016, 43). It is challenging to see the limitations and gaps in our understanding (Burbules and Beck 1999), and when we engage with differences through dialogue, we come to know such gaps and, as a result, transform our identities and relationships and develop alternative perspectives of the future. In general, reflection is considered a regular exercise for all ordinary people. Like in other fields, reflection emphasises questioning one's assumptions and knowledge in GCE. Transformative pedagogies create conditions for developing identities of teachers and students in relation to one another, where knowledge is constructed in the participation of educators and learners, and the process of identity formation is like "being-in-becoming" (Farren, 2016, p193). Developing learners' identities assign teachers a critical role, where teachers facilitate interpretation of the concepts of GCE and its practices; hence, it becomes crucial to prepare teachers to use transformative pedagogies so that they are enabled to provide the learners with the opportunities to use critical thinking, dialogue, and reflection making identity formation a meaningful process that serves the ultimate purpose of social transformation.

To conclude, to make the social transformation possible in the province, which may improve the lives of the common people in Sindh, the teaching of subjects like social studies and Pakistan, need to be taught effectively employing using pedagogy of critical global citizenship so that the learners may develop responsible identities at the intersection of local, national and global. Such multiple identities will help them reflect on the past, critically engage with society and envision a better future.

References

1. ADB. 2016. 'Policy Brief on Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan'. ADB 70. Philippines. https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/209661/female-labor-force-participation-pakistan.pdf.

2. Allana. 2012. 'International Research Journal of Arts & Humanities'. *Sindhi Society and Culture* 40:219–26.
3. Andreotti, Vanessa. 2010. 'Postcolonial and Post-Critical "Global Citizenship Education"'. In *Education and Social Change Connecting Local and Global Perspectives*, 238–50. Continuum International Publishing group.
4. Ashraf, Muhammad Azeem, Samson Maekele Tsegay, and Jin Ning. 2021. 'Teaching Global Citizenship in a Muslim-Majority Country: Perspectives of Teachers from the Religious, National, and International Education Sectors in Pakistan'. *Religions* 12 (5): 348. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel12050348.
5. Baildon, Mark, and Theresa Alviar-Martin. 2021. 'Dialogues about Global Citizenship Education across Asian Contexts'. In *Research on Global Citizenship Education in Asia; Conceptions, Perceptions, and Practice*, 207–23. United States of America: Information Age Publishing Inc.
6. Balding, Clare. n.d. 'DEC Pakistan Floods Apeal'. Audio. Accessed 27 September 2022. https://www.bbc.co.uk/sounds/play/m001c3vr.
7. Banks, James A. 2008. 'Diversity, Group Identity, and Citizenship Education in a Global Age'. *Educational Researcher* 37 (3): 129–39. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X08317501.
8. Blackmore, Chloe. 2016. 'Towards a Pedagogical Framework for Global Citizenship Education'. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning* 8 (1): 39–56. https://doi.org/10.18546/IJDEGL.8.1.04.
9. Brown, Gordon, ed. 2016. *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights in the 21st Century: A Living Document in a Changing World*. Open Book Publishers. https://doi.org/10.11647/OBP.0091.
10. Bullo, Momin. 2017. *Sukkur: Nostalgia of Things Past*. Hyderabad: Pakistan Heritage Perservation & Promotion Society.
11. Burbules, N.C, and R Beck. 1999. 'Critical Thinking and Critical Pedagogy: Relations, Difference and Limits'. In *Critical Theories in Education:Changing Terrains of Knowledge and Politics*, 45–65. London: Routledge.
12. Bureau of Statistics. 2021. *Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey: PSLM District Level 2019-20*. Islamabad: Government of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Planning development and Special Initiative.

13. Faiz, Asma. 2021a. 'Partition, Migration, and "Sons of the Soil"'. In *In Search of Lost Glory*, by Asma Faiz, 39–72. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780197567135.003.0003.
14. ———. 2021b. 'Sindh Before Partition: From Identity Construction to Territorial Ambitions'. In *In Search of Lost Glory*, by Asma Faiz, 11–38. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780197567135.003.0002.
15. Farren, Patrick. 2016. 'Transformative Pedagogy in Context: Being and Becoming'. *World Journal on Educational Technology: Current Issues* 8 (3): 190–204. https://doi.org/10.18844/wjet.v8i3.622.
16. Fiance Division Government of Pakistan. 2023. 'Pakistan Economic Survey 2022-23'. Pakistan Economic Survey 2022-23. 2023. https://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_2023.html.
17. Global Schools. 2016. *Global Citizenship Education in Europe. A Comparative Study of Education Policies across 10 EU Countries. Research Deliverable Issued within the European Project 'Global Schools'*. Trento, Italy: ProvinciaAutonoma di trento.
18. Govt. of Pakistan. 2022. 'Pakistan Bureau of Statistics'. Islamabad. https://www.pbs.gov.pk/content/final-results-census-2017.
19. Gul, Amber, Abbas Ali Chandio, Sajid Ali Siyal, Abdul Rehman, and Wu Xiumin. 2022. 'How Climate Change Is Impacting the Major Yield Crops of Pakistan? An Exploration from Long- and Short-Run Estimation'. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 29 (18): 26660–74. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-17579-z.
20. Guo, Linyuan. 2014. 'Preparing Teachers to Educate for 21st Century Global Citizenship: Envisioning and Enacting'. *Journal of Global Citizenship & Equity Education* 4 (4): 1–23.
21. Husain, Ishrat, I'jāzu Quraishī, and Nadeem Hussain. 2019. *The Economy of Modern Sindh: Opportunities Lost and Lessons for the Future*. First edition. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
22. Imber, Mark. 2002. 'The UN and Global Citizenship'. In *Global Citizenship: A Critical Introduction*, 114–24. New York: Routledge.
23. Jamal, Haroon. 2021. 'Educational Status of Pakistan: Pre

and Post 18th Amendment Scenario'. 106274. Social Policy and Development Centre (SPDC).
24. Jefferess, David. 2012. 'Unsettling cosmopolitanism: Global citizenship and the cultural politics of benevolence'. In *Postcolonial Perspectives on Global Citizenship Education*, 27–45. ROUTLEDGE RESEARCH IN EDUCATION. New York: Routledge.
25. Jooste, Nico, and Savo Heleta. 2017. 'Global Citizenship Versus Globally Competent Graduates: A Critical View From the South'. *Journal of Studies in International Education* 21 (1): 39–51. https://doi.org/10.1177/1028315316637341.
26. Kadiwal, Laila, and Naureen Durrani. 2018. 'Youth Negotiation of Citizenship Identities in Pakistan: Implications for Global Citizenship Education in Conflict-Contexts'. *British Journal of Educational Studies* 66 (4): 537–58. https://doi.org/10.1080/00071005.2018.1533099.
27. Khan, Themrise. 2020. 'FEMALE LABOUR MIGRATION FROM PAKISTAN: A SITUATION ANALYSIS'. Switzerland: International Labour Organization.
28. Lall, Marie, and Tania Saeed. 2020. *YOUTH AND THE NATIONAL NARRATIVE: Education, Terrorism and the Security State in Pakistan.* London: BLOOMSBURY ACADEMIC.
29. Leduc, Rhonda. 2013. 'Global Citizenship Instruction Through Active Participation: What Is Being Learned About Global Citizenship?' *The Educational Forum* 77 (4): 394–406. https://doi.org/10.1080/00131725.2013.822038.
30. Memon, Qurat Ul Ain, Shoaib Ahmed Wagan, Dong Chunyu, Xiao Shuangxi, and Luan Jingdong. 2019. 'An Analysis of Poverty Situation of Landless Peasants: Evidence from Sindh Pakistan'. *Journal of Poverty* 23 (4): 269–81. https://doi.org/10.1080/10875549.2018.1550462.
31. MFE&PT. 2017. 'National Education Policy 2017-25'. Ministry of federal education and professional training Islamabad.
32. Minorities Affairs Department. 2018. 'Percentage Wise Religion Population in Pakistan'. Islamabad. https://minorityaffairs.sindh.gov.pk/minority-community-in-sindh.
33. MOE. 2009. 'National Education Policy 2009'. Ministry of education, Govt of Pakistan.
34. MOFE&T. 2021. 'Directorate General of Religious

Education'. English. http://www.dgre.gov.pk/Detail/ZDk0YWE1NjgtN2ZiMS00MTY5LThiMjEtNjcxZmFmZjU3Njc3.

35. Osler, Audrely, and Hugh Starkey. 2005. *Changing Citizenship: Democracy and Inclusion in Education*. England: Open University Press.
36. Pais, Alexandre, and Marta Costa. 2020. 'An Ideology Critique of Global Citizenship Education'. *Critical Studies in Education* 61 (1): 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2017.1318772.
37. Pasha, Amna. 2015. 'Global Citizenship in Pakistan'. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning* 7 (1): 33–52.
38. Pashby, Karen. 2012. 'Questions for Global Citizenship Education in the Context of the "New Imperialism" For Whom? By Whom?' In *Postcolonial Perspectives on Global Citizenship Education*, 9–26. ROUTLEDGE RESEARCH IN EDUCATION. New York: Routledge.
39. Schattle, Hans. 2008. *The Practices of Global Citizenship*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Pub.
40. SE&LD. 2019. *Sindh Education Sector Plan (2019-24)*. School Education and Literacy Department, Govt of Sindh.
41. Shar, Noor Hussain. 2022. *Globalisation & Teacher Professionalisation in Sindh: Role of English Language, Foreign Aid and Neoliberalism in Teacher Professionalisation in Pakistan*. Karachi: Paramount Books (Pvt) Ltd.
42. Shar, Noor Hussain, Ali Gohar Chang, and Ayaz Latif Siyal. 2023. 'Teacher Educator's Conceptualisation of Global Citizenship'. *Annals of Human and Social Sciences* 4 (2): 849–60. https://doi.org/10.35484/ahss.2023(4-II)78.
43. Sheedai, Rahimdad Khan Molai. 2021. *Janatus Sindh*. New Edition. Karachi: Sindhica Academy.
44. Sherman, B., C. Maloney, Schiff, and B. Comstock. Letter. 2017. 'Congressional Documents and Publications', 17 August 2017. https://www-proquest-com.libproxy.ucl.ac.uk/docview/1930326744?pq-origsite=primo.
45. Sodhar, Zain-Ul-Abdin, Shamshad Rasool, and Khair-un Nisa. 2013. 'Madarsa System of Education in Pakistan: Challenges and Issues'. *International Research Journal of Arts & Humanities* 41.

46. UNESCO. 2015. *Global Citizenship Education: Topic and Learning Objectives*. France: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. http://www.alliance-respons.net/bdf_fiche-document-137_en.html.
47. UNESCO-IIEP. 2019. 'Situational Analysis of the Education in Sindh.